

The shield and the cave: motion and emotion in Plato's *Republic*

1. Frames

- a. Seeing through the frames, seeing the frames, seeing the seeing of the frames in the *Republic*

TEXT 1 *'Next compare our own natures to the following effect in respect of education and lack of education. For see (ιδε̅) some men in an underground cave, where they live, with an entrance that extends up towards the light...and see (ιδε̅) a little wall, built before the fire...' 'I see (Ορω̅).'*
[Glaucōn] *'Then see (Ὅρα) people carrying stuff behind the wall...'*

Republic 514a-c [Slings: my translations of *Republic*]

- b. Homer in the *Republic*

- i. First critique: 377d-380c; 383a-c; 386a ff. etc.
- ii. Forms of narration: 392d-4b
- iii. Suspended sentence: 595b
- iv. Retrial on skills and education: 598e-607b

2. Hephaestus and Socrates

- a. The world of the shield

TEXT 2 *Then first he form'd (δαίδαλλων) the immense and solid shield;
Rich various artifice emblaz'd the field;
Its utmost verge a threefold circle bound;
A silver chain suspends the massy round;
Five ample plates the broad expanse compose,
And godlike labours on the surface rose (ποιεῖ δαίδαλα πολλά ἰδυίησι πραπίδεσσιν)
There shone the image of the master-mind:
There earth, there heaven, there ocean he design'd;
The unwearied sun, the moon completely round;
The starry lights that heaven's high convex crown'd.
The Pleiads, Hyads, with the northern team;
And great Orion's more refulgent beam;
To which, around the axle of the sky,
The Bear, revolving, points his golden eye,
Still shines exalted on the ethereal plain,
Nor bathes his blazing forehead in the main.*

[Translation of Alexander Pope, 1715-20]

Iliad 18. 478-89

TEXT 3 *Thus the broad shield complete the artist crown'd
With his last hand, and pour'd the ocean round:
In living silver seem'd the waves to roll,
And beat the buckler's verge, and bound the whole.*

Iliad 18.607-10

b. The maker of the shield

TEXT 4 *A figured dance succeeds; such once was seen
In lofty Gnosus for the Cretan queen,
Form'd by Daedalean art; a comely band
Of youths and maidens, bounding hand in hand.*

έν δὲ χορὸν ποικίλλε περικλυτὸς ἀμφιγυήεις,
τῷ ἴκελον οἶόν ποτ' ἐνὶ Κνωσῷ εὐρείη
Δαίδαλος ἤσκησεν καλλιπλοκάμῳ Ἀριάδνη.
ἔνθα μὲν ἠΐθεοι καὶ παρθένοι ἀλφεισίβοιαι
ὄρχευντ' ἀλλήλων ἐπὶ καρπῷ χεῖρας ἔχοντες.

Iliad 18.590-4

c. The world of the Republic

TEXT 5 *These worked ornaments in the heaven, since they are worked in what is visible, can be thought to be the most beautiful and the most accurate of such things, but to fall short from the true ones, which are borne relative to each other by real speed and slowness in true number and all the true shapes, and carry all within, and which can be grasped by reason and thought, and not by sight: do you disagree? Not at all, he said. So, I said, we should use the worked ornamentation in the heavens as a model for understanding them. Just as if someone came across diagrams carefully drawn and worked by Daedalus or some other craftsman or designer: if they were expert geometers, and saw such things, they would think them beautifully worked, but that it would be absurd to look to them seriously to find the truth there about equality or doubleness or any other proportion.*

ταῦτα μὲν τὰ ἐν τῷ οὐρανῷ ποικίλματα, ἐπεὶ περ ἐν ὄρατῷ πεποικίλται, κάλλιστα μὲν ἠγεῖσθαι καὶ ἀκριβέστατα τῶν τοιούτων ἔχειν, τῶν δὲ ἀληθινῶν πολὺ ἐνδεῖν, ἃς τὸ ὄν τάχος καὶ ἡ οὐσα βραδυτῆς ἐν τῷ ἀληθινῷ ἀριθμῷ καὶ πᾶσι τοῖς ἀληθεσὶ σχήμασι φορὰς τε πρὸς ἀλλήλα φέρεται καὶ τὰ ἐνόητα φέρει, ἃ δὴ λόγῳ μὲν καὶ διανοίᾳ ληπτὰ, ὄψει δ' οὐ· ἢ σὺ οἶεις; Οὐδαμῶς γε, ἔφη. Οὐκοῦν, εἶπον, τῇ περὶ τὸν οὐρανὸν ποικιλίᾳ παραδείγμασι χρηστέον τῆς πρὸς ἐκεῖνα μαθήσεως ἔνεκα, ὁμοίως ὥσπερ ἂν εἴ τις ἐντύχοι ὑπὸ Δαιδάλου ἢ τινος ἄλλου δημιουργοῦ ἢ γραφέως διαφερόντως γεγραμμένοις καὶ ἐκπεπονημένοις διαγράμμασιν. ἠγήσαιτο γὰρ ἂν πού τις ἔμπειρος γεωμετρίας, ἰδὼν τὰ τοιαῦτα, κάλλιστα μὲν ἔχειν ἀπεργασίᾳ, γελοῖον μὲν ἐπισκοπεῖν αὐτὰ σπουδῆ ὡς τὴν ἀλήθειαν ἐν αὐτοῖς ληψόμενον ἴσων ἢ διπλασίων ἢ ἄλλης τινὸς συμμετρίας.

Republic 529c6-530a2

d. Making the world of the Republic

TEXT 6 *By the dog, I said, [the philosopher will be active] in her own city, very much so – but perhaps not in her native city, unless by a divine good chance. I understand, he said. You are talking about in the city which we have just founded in our account, the city that exists in words – although I doubt it exists anywhere on earth. But, I said, perhaps a model lies in the heavens for the one who wishes to see it and once they have done so, to find it in herself. It makes no difference whether it is anywhere, or will be; she should engage in the affairs of this one and no other.*

Republic 592a7-b4

3. Counting cities

a. Hephaestus' two cities, Socrates' cities

i. The wandering 'we' in the *Republic*

1. the conversational 'we': the characters of the dialogue e.g. 327a1, 327b1, 344d, 344e5;
2. the vernacular 'we': the commonplaces of community and culture e.g. 357b-c;
3. the Kallipolis 'we': the members of the state they are constructing 449a-451c; 452e-454c; 457b-458b, 459c5 ff. also at 373c.

4. Hephaestus' first city

a. Weddings and parties

TEXT 7 *Two cities radiant on the shield appear,
The image one of peace, and one of war.
Here sacred pomp and genial feast delight,
And solemn dance, and hymeneal rite;
Along the street the new-made brides are led,
With torches flaming, to the nuptial bed:
The youthful dancers in a circle bound
To the soft flute, and cithern's silver sound:
Through the fair streets the matrons in a row
Stand in their porches, and enjoy the show.*

Iliad 18.490-6

b. Kallipolis and weddings and parties

- i. Revising 'mine' (462a ff.)
- ii. Revising 'we' and the nature of being affected (462d ff.)
- iii. The maxim 'common among friends' (424a; 449c, cf. 457d; 543a)

TEXT 8 *Isn't it true that the whole community stretching throughout the body to the soul into a single arrangement under its leading part perceives the same things happening, and all of it feels pain together as a whole when the part is hurt? That is why we say that the person is pained in respect of the finger; and the same account goes for any other part of the person, both in respect of pain when a part is hurt, and in respect of pleasure when a part is healed.*

Republic 462c-d

c. Disputes in Hephaestus' first city

TEXT 9 *There in the forum swarm a numerous train;
The subject of debate, a townsman slain:
One pleads the fine discharged, which one denied,
And bade the public and the laws decide:*

*The witness is produced on either hand:
For this, or that, the partial people stand:
The appointed heralds still the noisy bands,
And form a ring, with sceptres in their hands:
On seats of stone, within the sacred place,
The reverend elders nodded o'er the case;
Alternate, each the attesting sceptre took,
And rising solemn, each his sentence spoke.
Two golden talents lay amidst, in sight,
The prize of him who best adjudged the right.*

Iliad 18.497-508

d. Lawsuits in Kallipolis

TEXT 10 *'Well, then, what about lawsuits and prosecutions between them: won't these pretty much disappear among them, since they have nothing that is private apart from their bodies, and the rest is common? Whence it will arise that they are not disputatious, in the ways that people enter into disputes about possessions and children and families?' 'For sure, they will disappear.' 'Nor will there be any justification for lawsuits about violence or assault among them. I suppose we shall say that it is fine and fair for people to defend themselves against others of the same age, since this will keep them fit.' 'Quite right.' 'and this law has this that is right about it:' I said, 'if someone gets annoyed with someone else and can satisfy their anger in this way, they will be less likely to provoke a greater dispute.' 'Absolutely.' 'And an older person will be authorised to command and to punish a younger one.' 'Clearly.' 'And it seems likely that no younger person, without the sanction of the rulers, will try to do violence to an older, nor hit them, nor in any other way show disrespect. For there will be two guardians that prevent it: fear and shame – shame that prevents laying hands on a parent, and fear lest others would come to help, as being the sons or brothers or fathers of the victim.'*

Republic 464d6-465b4

e. Artificial cities that come alive, move, talk and feel

5. **Hephaestus' second city**

a. The Iliad in the Iliad

TEXT 11 *Another part (a prospect differing far)
Glow'd with refulgent arms, and horrid war.
Two mighty hosts a leaguer'd town embrace,
And one would pillage, one would burn the place.
Meantime the townsmen, arm'd with silent care,
A secret ambush on the foe prepare:
Their wives, their children, and the watchful band
Of trembling parents, on the turrets stand.
They march; by Pallas and by Mars made bold:
Gold were the gods, their radiant garments gold,
And gold their armour: these the squadron led,
August, divine, superior by the head!*

*A place for ambush fit they found, and stood,
Cover'd with shields, beside a silver flood.*

Iliad 18.509-522

b. War in the Republic

TEXT 12 *'In matters of war,' I said, 'it is clear how they will proceed.' 'How?' said he. 'They will campaign in common, and they will bring their children along with them, if they are strong enough, so that just as in the case of other craftsmen, they will be able to watch the work which they will pursue when they grow up. And as well as watching, they will work and assist in the business of war, and attend on their fathers and mothers...'*

Republic 466e1-a5

c. Picturing craft

TEXT 13 *For example, the painter, we say, will paint a cobbler or a carpenter, or one of the other craftsmen, for us, although he [the painter] knows nothing of these crafts. But nonetheless, if the painter is a good one, then by drawing the carpenter and exhibiting him from afar, he will deceive children and stupid people into believing that he is a real carpenter.*

Republic 598b8-c4

6. **Three waves**

a. The waves

- i. How shall women and children be in common in Kallipolis (449d)? Can women be rulers in Kallipolis (415d-57b)?
- ii. How shall the people of Kallipolis have women and children in common' (457b-472a)?
- iii. How can Kallipolis come about? ...by philosophers ruling (472a-540d).

b. The maxim 'common among friends'

- i. Does the maxim apply to the third wave?
- ii. Does the cave tell us about what is 'common among friends'?

7. **The Cave**

a. How the prisoners move, speak and hear

TEXT 13 *They are like us, I said. For have such people, first of all, seen anything of themselves or each other, do you think, save the shadows cast by the fire on the wall of the cave in front of them? How could they have, he said, if they have been compelled to hold their heads fixed throughout their lives? So if they were able to have conversations with each other, don't you think that they would think themselves to be naming these things passing by, the things they see, as being? What if the prison also had an echo in the facing wall? Then when one of the carriers said something, do you think the prisoners would think what sounded anything but the passing shadow? Altogether, then, I said, such men would think that the truth is nothing but the shadows of the artefacts. (515a5-c2)*

- b. Disputes in the cave
 - i. Contradictory views of reality + resentment + [legal] action
 - ii. Compare Thrasymachus (336c ff.) and the *philotheamones* (475d ff.)

8. Epistemic emotions

- a. Conditions for epistemic emotions of this kind
 - i. The disagreement itself is their *gravamen*
 - ii. Reactive emotions that rely on the interpersonal expectations of an existing intellectual (rather than practical) relation.
 - iii. Differ from other kinds of epistemic emotion such as curiosity.
 - iv. Occurrent feelings related to dispositional and character traits of connected kinds and to virtues and vices.

'they help to emphasize how much we actually mind, how much it matters to us, whether the actions of other people—and particularly of some other people—reflect attitudes towards us of goodwill, affection, or esteem on the one hand or contempt, indifference, or malevolence on the other. If someone treads on my hand accidentally, while trying to help me, the pain may be no less acute than if he treads on it in contemptuous disregard of my existence or with a malevolent wish to injure me. But I shall generally feel in the second case a kind and degree of resentment that I shall not feel in the first. If someone's actions help me to some benefit I desire, then I am benefited in any case; but if he intended them so to benefit me because of his general goodwill towards me, I shall reasonably feel a gratitude which I should not feel at all if the benefit was an incidental consequence, unintended or even regretted by him, of some plan of action with a different aim'.

P.F. Strawson, *Freedom and Resentment and other essays* (1974) 5-6

- b. Emotions and dialectic
 - i. Dialectic as conversation (454a; 515b; 523b ff.; 526a; 531eff.; 534b ff.)
 - ii. 'asking just things of just people' (520a, e)
 - iii. The nature and the emotional content of accountability
 - iv. Moves against the 'pure reason' view of philosophy

9. Frames again

- a. The device of the description of a work of art makes particular connections between moving and talking and, in the case of *Iliad* and *Republic*, feeling
- b. But in the case of the *Republic* this frames a picture of epistemic emotions of the reactive kind as a central aspect of educational development (motion)
- c. Kallipolis, and its development, embedded in a social context ('common among friends')
- d. Motion/development and emotion are here inseparable
- e. Framing epistemic emotion and the reach of the depiction.